

# HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, July 26, 2006 David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street 1:29 P.M.

**COMMISSION MEMBERS:** PHILIP SUDING, Chair, Present

WILLIAM LA VOIE, Vice-Chair, Present

LOUISE BOUCHER, Present STEVE HAUSZ, Present

VADIM HSU, Present, arrived at 2:10 p.m.

ALEX PUJO, Present CAREN RAGER, Present FERMINA MURRAY, Present SUSETTE NAYLOR, Present

ADVISORY MEMBER: DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW, Absent CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: ROGER HORTON, Absent PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: WILLIAM MAHAN, Absent

**STAFF:** JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor, Absent

JAKE JACOBUS, Urban Historian, Present SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician II, Present

KATHLEEN GOO, Alternate Commission Secretary, Present

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION SUBMITTAL CHECKLIST		
(See El Pueblo Viejo District Guidelines & Design Review Submittal Requirements for Details)		
CONCEPT REVIEW	Required	Master Application & Submittal Fee - (Location: 630 Garden Street)  Photographs - of the existing building (if any), adjacent structures, composite panoramic view of the site, surrounding areas & neighborhood streetscape - mounted or folded to no larger than an 8.5" x 14" photo display board.  Plans - three sets of folded plans are required at the time of submittal & each time plans are revised.  Vicinity Map and Project Tabulations - (Include on first drawing)  Site Plan - drawn to scale showing the property boundaries, existing & proposed structures, building & area square footages, building height, areas to be demolished, parking, site topography, conceptual grading & retaining walls, & existing landscaping. Include footprints of adjacent structures.
	Suggested	Exterior elevations - showing existing & proposed grading where applicable.  Site Sections - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable.  Plans - floor, roof, etc.  Rough sketches are encouraged early in the process for initial design review to avoid pursuing incompatible proposals. However, more complete & thorough information is recommended to facilitate an efficient review of the project.
PRELIMINARY REVIEW	Required	Same as above with the following additions:  Plans - floor, roof, etc.  Site Sections - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable.  Preliminary Landscape Plans - required for commercial & multi-family; single family projects where grading occurs. Preliminary planting plan with proposed trees & shrubs & plant list with names. Plans to include street parkway strips.
	Suggested	Color & Material Samples - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" & detailed on all sets of plans.  Exterior Details - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc.  Materials submitted for preliminary approval form the basis for working drawings & must be complete & accurate.
FINAL & CONSENT	Required	Same as above with the following additions:  Color & Material Samples - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" and detailed on all sets of plans.  Cut Sheets - exterior light fixtures and accessories where applicable.  Exterior Details - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc.  Final Landscape Plans - landscape construction documents including planting & irrigation plan.  Consultant/Engineer Plans - electrical, mechanical, structural, & plumbing where applicable.

#### PLEASE BE ADVISED

- \*\* All approvals made by the Historic Landmarks Commission (HLC) are based on compliance with Municipal Code Chapter 22.22 and with adopted HLC guidelines. Some agenda items have received a mailed notice and are subject to a public hearing.
- \*\* The approximate time the project will be reviewed is listed to the left of each item. It is suggested that applicants arrive 15 minutes early. The agenda schedule is subject to change as cancellations occur. Staff will notify applicants of time changes.
- \*\* The applicant's presence is required. If an applicant is not present, the item will be postponed indefinitely. If an applicant cancels or postpones an item without providing advance notice, the item will be postponed indefinitely and will not be placed on the following HLC agenda. In order to reschedule the item for review, the applicant must fill out and file a Supplemental Application Form at 630 Garden Street (Community Development Department) and submit appropriate plans.
- \*\* The Commission may grant an approval for any project scheduled on the agenda if sufficient information has been provided and no other discretionary review is required. Substitution of plans is not allowed, if revised plans differing from the submittal sets are brought to the meeting, motions for preliminary or final approval will be contingent upon staff review for code compliance.
- \*\* Preliminary and Final Historic Landmarks Commission approval is valid for one year from the date of the approval unless a time extension or Building Permit has been granted.
- \*\* The Commission may refer items to the Consent Calendar for Preliminary and Final Historic Landmarks Commission approval.
- \*\* Items before the Commission may be appealed to the City Council. For further information on appeals, contact the Planning Division Staff or the City Clerk's office. Said appeal must be in writing and must be filed with the City Clerk at City Hall within ten (10) calendar days of the meeting at which the Commission took action or rendered its decision. The scope of this project may be modified under further review.
- \*\* AMERICANS WITH DISABILITIES ACT: In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need special assistance to participate in this meeting, please contact the Planning Division at (805) 564-5470. Notification at least 48 hours prior to the meeting will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements.
- \*\* AGENDAS, MINUTES and REPORTS: Copies of all documents relating to agenda items are available for review at 630 Garden St. and agendas and minutes are posted online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov. If you have any questions or wish to review the plans, please contact Susan Gantz, at (805) 564-5470 between the hours of 8:30 a.m. to noon and 1:00 p.m. to 4:00 p.m., Monday through Friday.

#### **LICENSING ADVISORY:**

The Business and Professions Code of the State of California and the Municipal Code of the City of Santa Barbara restrict preparation of plans for certain project types to licensed professionals. Applicants are encouraged to consult with Building and Safety Staff or Planning Staff to verify requirements for their specific projects.

Unlicensed persons are limited to the preparation of plans for:

- Single or multiple family dwellings not to exceed four (4) units per lot, of wood frame construction, and not more than two stories and basement in height;
- Non-structural changes to storefronts; and,
- Landscaping for single-family dwellings, or projects consisting solely of landscaping of not more than 5,000 square feet.

#### **NOTICE:**

- A. That on July 21, 2006 at 4:00 P.M., this Agenda was duly posted on the indoor and outdoor bulletin boards at the Community Development Department, 630 Garden Street, and online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov.
- B. This regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission will be broadcast live and rebroadcast in its entirety on Friday at 1:00 P.M. and again the following Friday at 1:00 P.M. on Channel 18.

C.

## **GENERAL BUSINESS:**

#### A. Public Comment:

Any member of the public may address the Historic Landmarks Commission for up to two minutes on any subject within their jurisdiction that is not scheduled for a public discussion before the Board on that day. The total time for this item is ten minutes. (Public comment for items scheduled on today's agenda will be taken at the time the item is heard.)

No public comment.

B. Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of July 12, 2006.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of

July 12, 2006, with corrections.

Action: Boucher/Naylor, 7/0/1, Hsu absent, Hausz abstained.

C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Bill La Voie.

Action: Pujo/Hausz, 8/0/0, Hsu absent.

- D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.
  - 1. Ms. Gantz made the following announcements:
    - a) Commissioner Hsu will be a few minutes late today.
    - b) Commissioner Hsu will be stepping down from Item 1, 1710 Mira Vista, and Item 6, 801 State Street, respectively.
    - c) Commissioner La Voie will be stepping down from Item 6, 801 State Street.
    - d) Review of the project at 2300 Garden Street, which was postponed to today's meeting at the applicant's request, has been postponed again to August 9, 2006 at the applicant's request.
    - e) Consent Calendar Item C, 1900 Lasuen Road Review After Final of minor wall bumpout at bathroom on east side of Building 11, has been referred to the Full Board.

E-1 Zone

## E. Subcommittee Reports.

Commissioner Hausz reported attending a recent introductory meeting with the De La Guerra Plaza Infrastructure *ad hoc* Subcommittee which, after much deliberation between architecture firms, chose Campbell & Campbell to have their first meeting with the Subcommittee in late August 2006.

Commissioner Boucher reported that the Santa Barbara Conservancy is also very interested in becoming involved again with the De La Guerra Plaza Infrastructure *ad hoc* Subcommittee for projects like the primary adobe infrastructure.

Chair Suding reported on attending the State of the Art Gallery Committee meeting this morning which is gearing up to have a new installation reviewed by the Commission on August 9, 2006. He also stated that there will be no pedestals above-grade, two plates mounted on the brick, and three objects utilizing two completely concealed mounted methods, with the other having either a stanchion or a flange. They will also bring the brass signs which they plan to have for didactic information.

#### F. Possible Ordinance Violations.

No violations reported.

#### \*\* THE BOARD RECESSED FROM 1:39 P.M. UNTIL 1:46 P.M. \*\*

#### **HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT**

1. 1710 MIRA VISTA AVE

(1:39) Assessor's Parcel I

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-090-015 Application Number: MST2006-00395

Owner: Christine McLaughlin

Agent: Post/ Hazeltine Associates

(Historic Structures/Sites Report – there is no proposed project at this time.)

#### (Review of Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Post/Hazeltine Associates.)

Present: Tim Hazeltine and Pam Post, Agents

Public comment opened at 1:51 p.m.

Mr Kellem De Forest asked a question regarding the date when Mira Vista Avenue was added in relation to the rear access entrance to the proposed project.

Public comment ended at 1:52 p.m.

<u>Staff comment:</u> Mr. Jake Jacobus, Associate Planner/Urban Historian, stated that he reviewed the report and agreed with the conclusions and recommendations found in the report, then referred it to the Commission for their consideration.

Motion: The Commission accepts the report as amended, with the following conditions:

1) Nomination of the building for Structure of Merit status. 2) To begin the process to landmark the building. 3) With acceptance of the report, the Commission does not

necessarily accept the proposed design for the pool house.

Action: Hausz/La Voie, 8/0/0.

## **HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT**

2. 00 W CABRILLO BLVD P-R/SD-3 Zone

(1:54) Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-120-ORW

Application Number: MST2004-00878 Owner: City of Santa Barbara

Landscape Architect: David Black

Agent: Hal Hill, Project Mgr II

(Proposed replacement of the Cabrillo Boulevard vehicular and pedestrian bridge over Mission Creek. The new bridge will be 131 feet long by 110 feet wide and will carry the same five lanes of traffic and pedestrian traffic that the existing bridge carries. The sidewalk on the north side will be six feet wide and the sidewalk on the south side will vary from 11 feet to 14.5 feet wide. The new multi-use trail bridge will be 20 feet wide. Banks of lower Mission Creek are to be reconstructed to allow for passage of 20-year storms, and this project will construct the portion of the Lower Mission Creek Project from Cabrillo Blvd. to State Street in accordance with the Lower Mission Creek EIR/EIS. Grading will include 490 cubic yards of cut.)

(Review and comments on excerpts of Preliminary Historic Property Survey Report, Finding of Adverse Effect Report, and Programmatic Section 4F Evaluation Report prepared by Applied Earthworks, Inc.)

Present: Pat Kelly, Assistant Public Works Director/City Engineer

Michael Berman, Project Planner/Environmental Analyst

<u>Staff comment:</u> Mr. Jake Jacobus, Associate Planner/Urban Historian, handed out excerpts and photo documentation of the Historic Properties Survey Report, and copies of the Finding Adverse Effect Report and the Programmatic Section 4F Evaluation Report for review by the Commission.

Mr. Kelly explained to the Commission that the purpose of the reports was to complete missing information from the last review by the Commission and to propose a process to go through design review which includes appointment of a Design Subcommittee and to plan an appropriate schedule for future Commission review, with consideration for limitations of the City process.

Mr. Jacobus indicated that the proposed project was last reviewed by the Commission in January, when the Commission adopted the 1927 design plan and not the 1913 design plan of the bridge.

Mr. Berman clarified that the bridge railing is considered as part of the building.

Commissioner La Voie requested the applicant provide the Commission with the *complete* Historic Structures Report before requesting the Commission's approval.

Public comment opened at 2:13 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, closed at 2:14 p.m.

Mr. Berman clarified that Measures to Minimize Harm Section of the Programmatic Section 4F Evaluation Report, intent is for the historic entry to the City to remain eligible for listing in the National Registry as an historic district, with the bridge as a contributing element to the historic district. The mitigation intent would be to replicate features of the period of significance and to document the new bridge, i.e., to mitigate the adverse impact of the destruction of the bridge.

Commission

Comments:

1) Applicant shall clarify if the district or bridge is eligible for inclusion in the national, state or local registry. 2) The Report should include the Pearl Chase Society Preservation Committee to the Report's list of interested parties. 3) Suggest reference to the Pioneers of American Landscape Design book as an excellent resource. 4) Commissioners Murray and La Voie, and Chair Suding are hereby appointed *ad hoc* liaisons for the Cabrillo Blvd. HLC Advisory Subcommittee. 5) Evaluation of the 1913 historic structure removal to be addressed to the Full Commission and to SHPO with reasons why it is not being incorporated into the new design since it was relinquished by Caltrans and incorporated into the design by the Olmstead Office. 6) The project shall receive Full Commission review based on these comments. 7) All comments are to be null and void until Full Commission acceptance of the complete MEA-approved Historical Structures Report.

## **CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**

3. 00 W CABRILLO BLVD P-R/SD-3 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-120-ORW
Application Number: MST2004-00878
Owner: City of Santa Barbara

Landscape Architect: David Black

Agent: Hal Hill, Project Mgr II

(Proposed replacement of the Cabrillo Boulevard vehicular and pedestrian bridge over Mission Creek. The new bridge will be 131 feet long by 110 feet wide and will carry the same five lanes of traffic and pedestrian traffic that the existing bridge carries. The sidewalk on the north side will be six feet wide and the sidewalk on the south side will vary from 11 feet to 14.5 feet wide. The new multi-use trail bridge will be 20 feet wide. Banks of lower Mission Creek are to be reconstructed to allow for passage of 20-year storms, and this project will construct the portion of the Lower Mission Creek Project from Cabrillo Blvd. to State Street in accordance with the Lower Mission Creek EIR/EIS. Grading will include 490 cubic yards of cut.)

(Third Concept Review and request to create and appoint an ad hoc HLC Advisory Subcommittee to assist in guiding the project design.)

(PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT AND PLANNING COMMISSION APPROVAL OF A COASTAL DEVELOPMENT PERMIT.)

Present: Pat Kelly, Assistant Public Works Director/City Engineer

Michael Berman, Environmental Analyst

THIS ITEM WAS NOT HEARD, BUT COMBINED IN CONJUNCTION WITH THE PREVIOUS HISTORIC STRUCTURE REPORT.

Public comment re-opened at 2:23 p.m.

Ms. Virginia Castagnola-Hunter suggested seasonal plantings in reference to previous comment by Commissioner La Voie regarding aesthetic "celebration" of the corner of the project, and expressed appreciation of the assignment of a landscape architect as *ad hoc* liaison for the Cabrillo Blvd. HLC Advisory Subcommittee for the proposed project.

Public comment ended at 2:25 p.m.

## **HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT**

4. 232 E LOS OLIVOS ST E-1 Zone

(2:26) Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-252-002

Application Number: MST2006-00191

Owner: Marilynn Jorgenson

Agent: Laura Bridley

Architect: Harrison Design Associates

Architect: Glen Deisler

(This is a City Landmark: Frothingham House and Garden. Proposal to replace four, two-light windows in one opening with three, three-light windows in three openings on the Garden Street elevation, construct a new exterior stucco screen wall, landing, and tile bench at the south elevation, and paint exterior of residence. New landscaping to include turf in the public right-of-way, new hedges in backyard, new ornamental plantings, and repairs to the lower terrace fountain. This parcel is located in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District Part II.)

(Review of Letter Addendum to Historic Structures/Sites Report regarding additional change to project for second-story window relocation prepared by Alexandra C. Cole, Preservation Planning Associates.)

Present: Alexandra Cole, Historian

Glen Deisler, Architect Earl Jahnke, Property Owner

<u>Staff comment:</u> Mr. Jake Jacobus, Associate Planner/Urban Historian, clarified the reason for the requested Letter Addendum to the Historic Structures Report.

Motion: The Commission accepts the report and the relocation of the bedroom window.

Action: Hausz/Pujo, 6/3/0, Boucher, La Voie and Hsu opposed.

Item re-opened at 2:34 p.m.

Public comment opened at 2:35 p.m.

Mr. Kellem De Forest suggested the applicant contact the previous owner of the house Bill Troiano to possibly lend some historical background information on the original additions to the house.

Public comment ended at 2:36 p.m.

Motion confirmed – no changes.

#### **REVIEW AFTER FINAL**

5. 232 E LOS OLIVOS ST E-1 Zone

(2:37) Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-252-002

Application Number: MST2006-00191

Owner: Marilynn Jorgenson

Agent: Laura Bridley

Architect: Harrison Design Associates

Architect: Glen Deisler

(This is a City Landmark: Frothingham House and Garden. Proposal to replace four, two-light windows in one opening with three, three-light windows in three openings on the Garden Street elevation, construct a new exterior stucco screenwall, landing, and tile bench at the south elevation, and paint exterior of residence. New landscaping to include turf in the public right-of-way, new hedges in backyard, new ornamental plantings, and repairs to the lower terrace fountain. This parcel is located in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District Part II.)

(Review After Final of as-built second-story window relocation.)

## (PROJECT REQUIRES HISTORIC RESOURCE FINDINGS AND FINDINGS FOR ALTERATIONS TO A CITY LANDMARK.)

Present: Glen Deisler, Architect

Earl Jahnke, Property Owner

Public comment opened at 2:38 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, closed at 2:39 p.m.

Motion: Final Approval of the Review After Final of the as-built second-story window relocation.

Action: Hausz/Pujo, 6/3/0, Boucher, La Voie and Hsu opposed.

### <u>CONCEPT REVIEW – NEW: PUBLIC HEARING</u>

6. 801 STATE ST C-2 Zone

(2:39) Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-400-013

Application Number: MST2006-00154

Owner: Hughes Land Holding Trust 5/9/84

Architect: Vadim Hsu

Business Name: Rocks Restaurant & Lounge

(This is a Structure of Merit: "Las Tiendas Building." Proposal to construct a 2,353 square foot thirdstory addition on an existing commercial building located in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District. The addition will be comprised of a new kitchen, bar, and indoor and outdoor patron seating areas, and will result in a structure that is 37'-6" tall at the roof ridge line. The project requires Development Plan Approval findings.)

## (PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT, HISTORIC RESOURCE FINDINGS, AND DEVELOPMENT PLAN APPROVAL FINDINGS.)

Present: Vadim Hsu, Architect

Kim Hughes, Property Owner Tammy Hughes, Property Owner

Koji Nomura, Owner of Rocks Restaurant & Lounge

Public comment opened at 2:51 p.m.

Mr. Kellem De Forest suggested consideration of redoing the entire façade to include a third story.

Public comment ended at 2:52 p.m.

Straw vote: How many Commissioners would like to see story poles for the proposed project? 7/0/0.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with the following comments: 1) Applicant to replace the

landscape planter rail with potted plants. 2) Applicant to present a 3D model presentation when returning to the Full Commission. 3) Applicant to provide story poles at each

awning support for the proposed project.

Action: Pujo/Hausz, 7/0/0, Hsu and La Voie stepped down.

## REVIEW AFTER FINAL/HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT

7. 1900 LASUEN RD R-2/4.0/R-H Zone

(3:15) Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-170-022

Application Number: MST99-00305 Owner: Orient Express Hotels

Architect: Henry Lenny

Agent: Project Solutions, LLC
Business Name: El Encanto Hotel

(This site is a Structure of Merit. Proposal to review the Master Plan for the El Encanto Hotel. The planned revisions to the site include relocating cottages, adding new cottages, new landscaping, parking additions and improvements and expansion of the main hotel structure. This portion of the work is Phase I and includes buildings 11 ("Wishing Well"), 14 ("Twin Pines"), 15 ("Waterfall"), and 16 ("Geranium"). Review of additional phases will follow.)

# (Review of Letter Addendum to Historic Structures/Sites Report for minor wall bump-out at bathroom on east side of Building 11.)

Present: Henry Lenny, Architect

Alexander Cole, Historian

James Jones, Representing Ownership Trish Allen, Associate Planner, SEPPS

<u>Staff comment:</u> Mr. Jake Jacobus, Associate Planner/Urban Historian, stated his reason for keeping Historic Structures Report on the Agenda was to keep up with the suggested changes to the proposed project, and cautioned the Commission on the cumulative effect of all the proposed changes to the proposed project. He then turned the discussion over to Commissioner La Voie for his comments on Item C, 1900 Lasuen for Building 11, which was referred to Full Board.

Motion: The Commission accepts the report.

Action: La Voie/Boucher, 6/3/0, Pujo, Murray, and Hausz opposed.

Motion: For the Commission to review the referred Full Board Consent Item C, 1900 Lasuen

Road.

Action: La Voie/Boucher, 9/0/0.

#### THIS ITEM WAS HEARD OUT OF ORDER.

#### **REVIEW AFTER FINAL**

C. 1900 LASUEN RD R-2/4.0/R-H Zone

(2:57) Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-170-022

Application Number: MST99-00305 Owner: Orient Express Hotels

Architect: Henry Lenny

Agent: Project Solutions, LLC
Business Name: El Encanto Hotel

(This site is a Structure of Merit. Proposal to review the Master Plan for the El Encanto Hotel. The planned revisions to the site include relocating cottages, adding new cottages, new landscaping, parking additions and improvements and expansion of the main hotel structure. This portion of the work is Phase I and includes buildings 11 ("Wishing Well"), 14 ("Twin Pines"), 15 ("Waterfall"), and 16 ("Geranium"). Review of additional phases will follow.)

## (Review After Final of minor wall bump-out at bathroom on east side of Building 11.)

Present: Henry Lenny, Architect

Alexandra Cole, Architectural Historian James Jones, Representing Ownership

Motion: Continued two weeks to Full Board until a determination can be made whether changes

are reasonable and necessary or to utilize the wall bump-out or not, and until the Staff

Hearing Officer modification comments can be reviewed.

Action: Hausz/Rager.

Substitute Motion: Continued two weeks to the Consent Calendar with the following comments:

1) The Applicant shall explore a design without the bump-out to the building.

2) Restore the two proposed windows to their prior repaired condition which

would therefore not require a modification.

Action: La Voie/Hausz, 9/0/0.

## **IN-PROGRESS REVIEW**

8. 1900 LASUEN RD R-2/4.0/R-H Zone

(3:27) Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-170-022

Application Number: MST2005-00490 Owner: Orient Express Hotels

Architect: Henry Lenny

Applicant: Project Solutions, LLC
Business Name: El Encanto Hotel

(This is a Structure of Merit. Proposal to review the Master Plan for the El Encanto Hotel. The planned revisions to the site include relocating cottages, adding new cottages, new landscaping, parking additions and improvements and expansion of the main hotel structure. This portion of the work is Phase II and includes buildings the main building, relocation of the swimming pool, the west parking lot, the historic arbor, and units 2, 3, 4, 17, 18, 19, 25, 26, 27, 28 and 29. Review of additional phases will follow. Phase I of the project (MST99-00305) is complete.)

(Continued In-Progress review of Cottages 28 and 29 of Group K.)

(COMMENTS ONLY ON COTTAGE 28 WHICH REQUIRES PLANNING COMMISSION APPROVAL; COTTAGE 29 REQUIRES HISTORIC RESOURCE FINDINGS AND COMPLIANCE WITH PLANNING COMMISSION RESOLUTION NO. 057-04.)

Present: Henry Lenny, Architect

Alexandra Cole, Architectural Historian James Jones, Representing Ownership Trish Allen, Associate Planner, SEPPS

Motion: COTTAGES 29 OF GROUP K.

Preliminary Approval and continued indefinitely to the Consent Calendar with the following conditions: 1) North and west elevations are approved as submitted Historic

Resource Findings. 2) The balcony shall be reduced to 30-inches. **COTTAGES 28 OF GROUP K**.

Continued indefinitely with positive comments to the Planning Commission.

Action: Pujo/Boucher, 9/0/0.

Staff to Track: 1) Buildings 4, 28, 29, and 25, 26, 27 or Group K need an Addendum Letter by the

Historian either prior to or concurrent with Final Approval for compatibility with the surrounding historic structures. 2) Historic Structures Findings to be made for Cottage

29.

## **CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**

9. 1900 LASUEN RD R-2/4.0/R-H Zone

(3:32) Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-170-022

Application Number: MST2005-00490
Owner: Orient Express Hotels

Architect: Henry Lenny

Applicant: Project Solutions, LLC
Business Name: El Encanto Hotel

(This is a Structure of Merit. Proposal to review the Master Plan for the El Encanto Hotel. The planned revisions to the site include relocating cottages, adding new cottages, new landscaping, parking additions and improvements and expansion of the main hotel structure. This portion of the work is Phase II and includes buildings the main building, relocation of the swimming pool, the west parking lot, the historic arbor, and units 2, 3, 4, 17, 18, 19, 25, 26, 27, 28 and 29. Review of additional phases will follow. Phase I of the project (MST99-00305) is complete.)

#### (Continued review of Main Building.)

## (PROJECT REQUIRES HISTORIC RESOURCE FINDINGS AND COMPLIANCE WITH PLANNING COMMISSION RESOLUTION NO. 057-04.)

Present: Henry Lenny, Architect

Alexandra Cole, Architectural Historian James Jones, Representing Ownership Trish Allen, Associate Planner, SEPPS

Motion: Continued two weeks with the Applicant to continue studying the exiting door from the

proposed kitchen.

Action: Hausz/Boucher, 9/0/0.

## **CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**

10. 1900 LASUEN RD R-2/4.0/R-H Zone

(3:40) Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-170-022

Application Number: MST2005-00490 Owner: Orient Express Hotels

Architect: Henry Lenny

Applicant: Project Solutions, LLC
Business Name: El Encanto Hotel

(This is a Structure of Merit. Proposal to review the Master Plan for the El Encanto Hotel. The planned revisions to the site include relocating cottages, adding new cottages, new landscaping, parking additions and improvements and expansion of the main hotel structure. This portion of the work is Phase II and includes buildings the main building, relocation of the swimming pool, the west parking lot, the historic arbor, and units 2, 3, 4, 17, 18, 19, 25, 26, 27, 28 and 29. Review of additional phases will follow. Phase I of the project (MST99-00305) is complete.)

(Continued review of proposed valet parking structure and tennis court.)

## (COMMENTS ONLY; THIS PORTION OF THE PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT AND PLANNING COMMISSION APPROVAL.)

Present: Henry Lenny, Architect

Alexandra Cole, Architectural Historian James Jones, Representing Ownership

Public comment opened at 3:49 p.m.

Mr. Kellem De Forest expressed concern regarding the exit routes for valet from the parking lot.

Public comment closed at 3:49 p.m.

Motion: Continued two weeks to Full Board.

Action: Hausz/Rager, 9/0/0.

#### **CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED**

11. 1900 LASUEN RD R-2/4.0/R-H Zone

(3:52) Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-170-022

Application Number: MST2005-00490 Owner: Orient Express Hotels

Architect: Henry Lenny

Applicant: Project Solutions, LLC
Business Name: El Encanto Hotel

(This is a Structure of Merit. Proposal to review the Master Plan for the El Encanto Hotel. The planned revisions to the site include relocating cottages, adding new cottages, new landscaping, parking additions and improvements and expansion of the main hotel structure. This portion of the work is Phase II and includes buildings the main building, relocation of the swimming pool, the west parking lot, the historic arbor, and units 2, 3, 4, 17, 18, 19, 25, 26, 27, 28 and 29. Review of additional phases will follow. Phase I of the project (MST99-00305) is complete.)

(Continued Concept Review of alternate swimming pool/fitness center design of Group E.)

Present: Henry Lenny, Architect

Alexandra Cole, Architectural Historian Heather Miller, Representing Ownership

Public comment opened at 4:04 p.m.

Mr. Kellem De Forest addressed a few questions to the applicant regarding straight paths vs. curved paths and rectangular cut stone of the proposed project, to which the applicant responded they will research and respond directly to Mr. De Forest.

Public comment ended at 4:07 p.m.

Motion: Continued two weeks with the following comments: 1) Restudy re-proportioning the

scale of the pool and fitness center to a less monolithic design in size and height and a more compatible design in keeping with the other buildings on the site. 2) Study returning to the charm of the romantic original design, and eliminate the underground structure. 3) Handicap access is acceptable. 4) Offset curve is acceptable as long as it

does not meet a more vertical line.

Action: Boucher/Naylor, 9/0/0.

## **CONSENT CALENDAR**

#### NEW ITEM

A. 1134 CHAPALA ST C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-231-001 Application Number: MST2006-00441

Owner: Katherine Elaine Kearny

Applicant: Amalia Gonzales
Architect: Johnston Marklee

(Proposal to replace existing awning fabric, install one new rooftop air conditioning condenser unit, and replace exterior light fixtures.)

Final Approval as submitted with the condition that the canvas replacement is to be the "Walnut Brown Tweed" #4618-0000 Sunbrella fabric.

## **FINAL REVIEW**

B. 716 STATE ST C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-092-020 Application Number: MST2006-00343 Owner: 710 State St Partners

Applicant: Doug Keep

Business Name: Proposed Mac Retail Store

(Proposal to replace the entry doors to comply with ADA requirements, remove and replace the existing entry façade base tile, replace lower storefront glass with new laminate glass, and paint all exposed wood (except corbels) leaving the existing plaster the same color.)

#### (Final Approval of door details.)

Final Approval as submitted.

## **REVIEW AFTER FINAL**

C. 1900 LASUEN RD R-2/4.0/R-H Zone

(2:57) Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-170-022

Application Number: MST99-00305 Owner: Orient Express Hotels

Architect: Henry Lenny

Agent: Project Solutions, LLC
Business Name: El Encanto Hotel

(This site is a Structure of Merit. Proposal to review the Master Plan for the El Encanto Hotel. The planned revisions to the site include relocating cottages, adding new cottages, new landscaping, parking additions and improvements and expansion of the main hotel structure. This portion of the work is Phase I and includes buildings 11 ("Wishing Well"), 14 ("Twin Pines"), 15 ("Waterfall"), and 16 ("Geranium"). Review of additional phases will follow.)

(Review After Final of minor wall bump-out at bathroom on east side of Building 11.)

ITEM REFERRED TO THE FULL BOARD.

#### **REVIEW AFTER FINAL**

#### D. 1914 SANTA BARBARA ST

E-1 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-382-023 Application Number: MST2005-00248 Owner: Else Robert and Ann Dundon

Architect: DesignArc

(This is on the Potential Historic Resource List: "Kennedy House." Proposed additions and alterations to an existing 2,600 square foot residence. Proposal to add a 95 square foot entry, a new 450 square foot patio with 200 square foot wood trellis, a new 95 square foot second floor balcony, replace existing fixed windows with double hung windows, and replace two double hung windows on south elevation with French door. Also proposed is to replace 600 square feet of concrete paving with the same amount of permeable paving and add 26 linear feet of new fence, all on a 15,015 square foot lot.)

#### (Review After Final of additional window replacements.)

Final Approval as submitted of the Review After Final as proposed on the south elevation, with the condition that the applicant return to the HLC staff with drawings indicating a recessed wood panel below the windows as noted on the drawings submitted.

## **NEW ITEM**

#### E. 215 E FIGUEROA ST

R-3 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-162-037 Application Number: MST2006-00431

Owner: City of Santa Barbara Applicant: City of Santa Barbara Contractor: Petroleum Specialties

(Proposal to install a temporary 500 gallon above-ground fuel tank on a new concrete pad in front of the Santa Barbara Police Station building. The tank will be enclosed by a 5'-6" tall solid wood fence painted to match the existing wall, and is proposed to be in place for approximately two years.)

Final Approval as submitted for a two-year period.

## FINAL REVIEW

#### F. 2219 CHAPALA ST E-3 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-183-006 Application Number: MST2006-00153

Owner: Brent Kimball Architect: Tom Jacobs

(This is on the City's Potential List of Historic Resources: "Eder Residence." Proposal for a 977 square foot two-story addition to an existing 1,612 square foot, two-story single-family residence with a 541 square foot, attached two-car garage on an 11,245 square foot parcel. The proposal also includes the demolition and reconstruction of a portion of the residence, new perimeter site walls ranging in height from six inches to eight feet, a new water feature, and new landscape and hardscape improvements. The project will result in a 3,130 square foot residence.)

## (Final Approval is requested.)

Final Approval as submitted.